

THE ANDREW MELLON CASE

Lesson Plan for Grades 11-12

Essay Grading Rubric: Total Points 20

Criteria	Excellent (4 points)	Proficient (3 points)	Developing (2 points)	Needs Improvement (1 point)
Thesis and Argument	Clearly states a strong thesis and effectively answers the prompt with a well-reasoned argument	Thesis is clear but could be more developed; argument is mostly logical	Theis is unclear or weak; argument lacks depth	No clear thesis, argument is unfocused or missing
Use of Evidence	Uses specific, well-chosen examples from the lesson or from research to support claims	Uses relevant examples, but they could be stronger or more thoroughly explained	Includes some evidence, but it is weak, unclear, or not fully connected to the argument	Minimal or no evidence used to support claims
Analysis and Critical Thinking	Thoughtful analysis demonstrating deep understanding of legal and ethical implications	Analysis is present but could be deeper or more nuanced	Limited analysis; relies too much on summary rather than interpretation	Lacks analysis; little critical engagement with the topic
Organization and Clarity	Essay is well structured, with clear paragraphs and logical flow of ideas	Organization is mostly strong, but some transitions or sections could be clearer	Some structure, but ideas may be jumbled or hard to follow	No clear organization; difficult to follow
Grammar and Mechanics	Few or no errors in spelling, grammar, or punctuation	Some minor errors, but they do not distract from meaning	Noticeable errors that sometimes interfere with understanding	Frequent errors that make the essay difficult to read

Total Score: _____/ 20